Sediment Oiling and Service Loss

Presented by: John Slocomb, Ph.D. ENTRIX, Inc.

HEA Metric Workshop

4-6 December 2007 The New England Center University of New Hampshire Durham, NH





Sediment Toxicity

- Different Methods:
 - Total PAH Concentration:
 - ERM Quotient = Estimated Pr(Toxicity) = Service Loss
 - Toxicity estimated from total PAH concentration
 - Estimates lack site-specificity
 - Chronic Toxicity Measurements:
 - Actual Pr(Toxicity) = Service Loss
 - Toxicity site-specificity achieved
 - What is primary cause of toxicity?
 - Is a TIE or PAH fingerprinting necessary?



Sediment Chemistry and Service Loss

Site Priority	Chemical Characteristics	Pr(Toxicity)
Highest	Mean ERM Quotient: > 1.5 ERM Values: > 10 Exceeded	74% 85%
Medium-High	Mean ERM Quotient: 0.51 – 1.5 ERM Values: 6 - 10 Exceeded	46% 52%
Medium-Low	Mean ERM Quotient: 0.11 – 0.5 ERM Values: 1 - 5 Exceeded	30% 32%
Lowest	Mean ERM Quotient: < 0.1 No ERL Values Exceeded	12% 11%

Source: Long and MacDonald (1998); Long et al. (1998)



Some Questions to Consider

- Does toxicity reflect realistic loss of sediment services?
 - Is it too conservative?
 - Can (or should) it be scaled appropriately?
 - How would defensible scaling be performed?
- Is ERM Quotient method adequate?
 - Based on site-specific total PAH concentrations
 - Resulting toxicity estimate lacks site-specificity
- Is site-specific chronic toxicity adequate?
 - Needs significant relationship to spill-related total PAH
 - Is it too conservative?
 - Can (or should) it be scaled appropriately?
 - How would defensible scaling be performed?



Some Questions to Consider (Cont'd)

- How is recovery estimated?
 - Is additional (long-term) sampling & testing necessary?
 - Can sediment accretion or PAH degradation estimates be used?
- How is a suitable reference envelop determined?
- How is sediment injury coupled with aboveground injury to produce overall loss of services for shoreline segments?
 - Required to avoid double-counting injury



All models are wrong but some are useful

G. Box (1979)

